

CHAUNCEE SMITH  
PRESIDENT

ASIYAHOLA SANKARA  
VICE PRESIDENT

JASMIN SAN LUIS  
ACTING COMMISSION EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT



KAREN BASS  
MAYOR

CONNIE LLANOS  
INTERIM GENERAL MANAGER

## ITEM #3

### MINUTES January 12, 2023 5:00 PM

#### CONVENED

The Traffic Enforcement Alternatives Advisory Task Force (Task Force) convened a regular meeting in a virtual session on Thursday, January 12 at 5:04 PM in Los Angeles, CA.

#### ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

##### Item 1 – Welcome

President Chauncey Smith called the meeting to order.

##### Item 2 – Roll Call

President Chauncey took a roll call of the Task Force members by name.

1. Asiyahola Sankara – present
2. Benjamin Pezzillo – present
3. Candyce Kornblum – present
4. Chauncey Smith – present
5. Elmer Roldan – present
6. Jesus Garcia – present
7. Leslie Cooper Johnson – present
8. Lin Min Kong – present
9. Ma'ayan Dembo – present
10. Moises Gomez – present
11. Patricia Joyce Strong-Fargas – present
12. Rae Huang – present
13. Yolanda Davis-Overstreet – present

**Absent:** None

**Present:** Jonathan Groat, Deputy City Attorney; Pamela Lee, Program Manager (PM); Wajenda Chambeshi, Deputy Project Manager (DPM); Commander Steven Lurie; Richard France, Estolano Advisors (EA), Charlotte Will, Estolano Advisors (EA); Charles Brown, Research Team (RT) – Equitable Cities (EC), Carmen Kuan, Research Team (RT) – Equitable Cities (EC), Tamika Butler, Research Team (RT) – Equitable Cities (EC), Madeline Brozen, Research Team (RT) – Equitable Cities (EC)

**Item 3 – Approval of Minutes**

Member Moises moved, seconded by Member Rae to approve the Minutes of December 15, 2022.

CEA Jasmin took roll call

Asiyahola – yes

Benjamin - yes

Candyce - yes

Chauncey - yes

Elmer - yes

Jesus - yes

Leslie - yes

Lin Min - yes

Ma'ayan - yes

Moises - yes

Patricia - yes

Rae - yes

Yolanda - yes

Unanimously APPROVED.

**PUBLIC FORUM**

No comments taken.

**ACTION ITEM** *(taken out of order)*

**Item 9** - Findings to Continue Teleconference Meetings Pursuant to AB 361 – In accordance with AB 361 Section 3(e)(3) that, while the state of emergency due to the COVID-19 pandemic, as originally proclaimed by the Governor on March 4, 2020, remains active and/or state or local officials have imposed or recommended measures to promote social distancing, this legislative body has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency and that the state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of the members to meet safely in person and/or state or local officials continue to impose or recommend measures to promote social distancing.

President Chauncey stated that in accordance with AB 361 Section 3(e)(3) that, while the state of emergency due to the COVID-19 pandemic, as originally proclaimed by the Governor on March 4, 2020, remains active and/or state or local officials have imposed or recommended measures to promote social distancing, this legislative body has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency and that the state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of the members to meet safely in person and/or state or local officials continue to impose or recommend measures to promote social distancing.

Member Patricia moved, seconded by Member Elmer to approve Item #9.

CEA Jasmin took roll call votes by name.

Asiyahola – yes

Benjamin - yes

Candyce - yes

Chauncey - yes

Elmer - yes  
Jesus - yes  
Leslie - yes  
Lin Min - yes  
Ma'ayan - yes  
Moises - yes  
Patricia - yes  
Rae - yes  
Yolanda - yes  
Unanimously APPROVED.

PM Pamela introduced Assistant General Manager (AGM) Bridget Smith who was present at the meeting.

AGM Smith addressed the task force, gave a brief background of her role in the Department, and thanked everyone for letting her participate and observe the meeting.

### **INFORMATIONAL ITEMS**

#### **Item 4 – Community Outrage Over the Death of Keenan Anderson**

President Chauncey presented the item and provided some background information and shared his personal thoughts.

The task force members shared comments.

- Member Asiyahola shared how he felt after viewing the body camera footage released by LAPD. He stated that this is the type of situation where the task force should come up with a report that lays out policy changes that if adopted, or if it would have been in place, this would not have happened. He shared the vigil information scheduled for Keenan.
- Member Candyce stated how most of the people in the City felt appalled and mystified and that this has little to do with traffic and much more to do with training, personalities, and things that are not being addressed by our City and other cities.
- Member Patricia stated that she sends her prayers to the family and to the young men and women who have been stopped and continuously harassed by the police; shared how she felt as this continues on; and glad that she is on this task force to help discontinue these types of action.
- Member Elmer shared how he felt watching the video; believes it is much bigger than a training issue; feels stuck on a solution and that these encounters are intentional; and talked about the types of encounters that happen in his community for many years, including his own experience.
- Member Yolanda expressed how she felt after seeing the post and shared her thoughts as a mother relating to a son; how this should be looked at as a humane crisis for black lives; need more activated work from ground zero collectively moving forward; and to support the Black Lives Matter.

#### **Item 5 – Presentation on Existing and New LAPD Policies and Procedures**

President Chauncey introduced the item and stated that Commander Lurie will make the presentation. Comments, questions, and answers were provided.

- Member Asiyahola stated how it was important to learn about LAPD's new policies pertaining to traffic stops given that it is new and it pertains to the advisory committee's work, but he may not be able to engage with a presentation by Commander Lurie about the new policy that has been in place but did not save Keenan Anderson's life, and added that he would like to table the item and circle back at a later date.
- President Chauncee echoed Member Asiyahola's sentiment and stated that the timing was not ideal in the wake of Keenan's death and with respect to Commander Lurie, acknowledged the work that he had prepared for the meeting, and seconded Member Asiyola's motion to table the item.
- Member Leslie moved to table Item 5 to a future task force meeting, seconded by President Chauncee.
- EA Richard opened the item for discussion.
- President Chauncee further clarified that the discussion was to table the item not cancel the item.
- Commander Lurie voiced his agreement and stated that he cannot and will not comment on the three incidents that have been mentioned. It would be a better conversation to have on another forum when more facts are available. He echoed the sentiment felt by others and also felt heartfelt emotion learning of this tragedy of three people dying at the beginning of the year. He added that he is always available and will remain available as a resource.
- PM Pamela highlighted that there are two more task force meetings available to table this item which limits the options. She offered that if the task force wishes to convene a separate meeting with just Commander Lurie, herself, and City staff in between meetings to allow for the LAPD presentation, that it could be scheduled.
- EA Richard clarified PM Pamela's suggestion to amend the motion to specify a date when the presentation will occur.
- PM Pamela added that if the task force does not want the presentation all together that it was also an option.
- Member Lin Min stated that it would be great to propose a date for the presentation since everyone was present.
- Member Benjamin asked if the meeting could be optional and still have the presentation for those who want to see it or does it require a quorum.
- PM Pamela agreed with Member Benjamin's statement and believed that it was possible to make it an optional meeting.
- DCA Jonathan Groat clarified that in order to take an action, there needs to be a quorum present and since this item is informational, the task force could have a meeting with less than a quorum of this body and no votes can take place, and it would just be to hear the issue.
- President Chauncee asked Member Benjamin if he had a suggestion.
- Member Benjamin suggested that it should be up for discussion since he did not know how the other members felt about it, and that there should be flexibility for those who want to opt out and those who want to see the presentation.
- Commander Lurie asked PM Pamela to confirm that it does not need to be a task force meeting since a quorum will not be required and would just need to come up with a convenient time; also, that he would be happy to make a Department presentation to the community about LAPD's policy and policy changes and reform over the last year or two and anybody can attend, which they do all the time.

- DCA Groat expressed concerns and explained how a Brown Act could still be implicated, and advised that if it is a community meeting to make sure less than a quorum of this body should attend that meeting so it does not implicate a Brown Act.
- President Chauncee proposed to schedule another task force meeting or optional, and in setting up the meeting it would not be aim for a quorum in order to take action so all task force members are aware and will be separate set aside from the regularly agendized item in which the task force will be taking action on the subsequent two meetings that have already been scheduled.
- PM Pamela addressed some of the questions on the chat from the following folks: Madeline – Jonathan Groat is our City Deputy Attorney and supports LADOT; and Member Ma'ayan – Presentation, going with President Chauncee's suggestion and described what the advisory task force would look like, staffing, and one agenda informational item.
- DCA Groat advised that this could be handled the same way as scheduling these meetings and that the only difference is that Estolano and Associates would likely not be at the meeting.
- President Chauncee suggested scheduling the same day as the next meeting but a separate meeting time 30 minutes before or 30 minutes after the regular meeting.
- Member Lin Min suggested picking a date while everyone was at the meeting.
- PM Pamela offered Thursday, February 2 at 5pm, one hour.

Member Leslie amended and restated her motion to table Agenda Item 5 from today's meeting agenda and have it covered during a meeting on February 2<sup>nd</sup> at 5pm, seconded by Member Patricia.

CEA Jasmin took roll call votes by name.

Asiyahola – yes

Benjamin - yes

Candyce - yes

Chauncee - yes

Elmer - yes

Jesus - yes

Leslie - yes

Lin Min - yes

Ma'ayan - yes

Moises - yes

Patricia - yes

Rae - yes

Yolanda - yes

Unanimously APPROVED.

### **Item 6 – Research Subcommittee Update – Quantitative Analysis**

Madeline Brozen, Research Team (RT), presented the report shared with a slide presentation.

Comments, questions, and answers were provided.

- President Chauncee expressed his appreciation to Madeline for her very rigorous analysis and how it was extremely helpful. He shared two things that resonated with him: 1) The fact that there is an extremely racial disproportionate impact particularly on black folks shown on the data analysis; and 2) Appreciated the analysis on different types of traffic violations. He raised a couple of questions: 1) Was she able

to do a data cut for race violation types based on moving vs non-moving vs equipment to examine if there is greater disparities in those two categories based on race; and 2) a similar cut for violation types based on geographic location, are there greater proportion of stops for non-moving and equipment violations in areas like South LA and Inglewood vs Beverly Hills.

- RT Madeline explained how they can do an analysis on the items mentioned, why they do not have them at the moment, and what needs to be done
- President Chauncey asked if a discovery hit analysis was done.
- RT Madeline confirmed that they did not.
- President Chauncey stated that if there is a capacity to do so, it would be specifically for stops where the reason for the stop fell within the categories of non-moving, administrative or equipment and not so much for speeding.
- Based on Commander Lurie's information about data collected on individual officers, Member Lin Min asked if LAPD tracks officers who have a higher proportion in terms of stopping by race.
- Commander Lurie confirmed that they do track and that they also compare it to the race of the officer who is doing the stop. He added that they have also been tracking the data about non-moving violations, equipment-related violations leading to what the research team accurately pointed out as other, and that it was that number and that trend that led to their new policy.
- With regards to the data on use of force broken down by race, Member Lin Min asked RT Madeline if the percentage was higher among Latinos than African Americans.
- RT Madeline shared the slide on the screen on the use of force by race/ethnicity and explained how it was not looking at relative to the City population but at what percentage of the different racial ethnic groups are stopped in the traffic stops; higher rates of use of force; and that a greater percent both in Black and Hispanic/Latino drivers and an increase in terms of use of force used against those drivers at a higher rate than which they are stopped. Added that in terms of relative to the City population, the Black drivers are much more disproportionate to the population for that group.
- Member Lin Min asked if the use of force was broken down into categories.
- RT Madeline responded by referencing the slide that shows the description of actions that could be taken and pointed out that the bolded actions are categorized.
- Member Lin Min asked if there is specific data broken down by these types of actions. (referring to the slide)
- RT Madeline stated that you have it for one of these (referring to the slide) and that there are 22 different ones.
- Member Lin Min suggested that there could be a slide comparing all of these (referring to the slide), which are the top five and the greatest percentage used across races.
- RT Madeline acknowledged that it was a great suggestion.
- Member Elmer elaborated on his comment on the chat that the term force seems to undermine that these are life threatening situations.
- RT Madeline thanked Member Elmer for lifting that up and stated that sometimes seeing data presented this way dehumanizes what the actual interaction is and that they want to make sure they are lifting up the human element and not trying to collapse this into just a category.
- Member Asiyahola echoed Member Elmer's statement and that it was a great point and stated that even the statistic .001% use of deadly force is too high; and he

agreed with Member Elmer's point, and to RT Madeline's mention about how we make sure the numbers and the way it is presented is not dehumanizing or minimizing.

- President Chauncee concurred with Members Elmer and Asiyahola and stated that these are examples of police violence. He suggested that when at the point of converting the quantitative analysis combining with qualitative for the formal study to City Council that it would be helpful to make sure the content is packaged in a way so that deeper meaning of the data is captured in a holistic way, to have some reflection of that and to partner bunch of numbers with a snippet of what happened to Keenan being killed by the police, and that data is able to resonate in a way that speaks not only to the minds but also the hearts of policymakers who will be reviewing the work of the task force.
- DPM Wajenda called everyone's attention to the time and wanted to know if the group needed to take a vote to continue with the other presentation.
- PM Pamela clarified that the group did not need to take a vote and that it was just a time check.

### **Item 7 – Self-Enforcing Streets Literature Review Data Draft**

President Chauncee moved to table Item 7 – Self-Enforcing Streets Literature Review Draft to the top of discussion and first informational item to be discussed at the next task force meeting, seconded by Member Asiyahola.

CEA Jasmin took roll call votes by name.

Asiyahola – yes  
Benjamin - yes  
Candyce - yes  
Chauncee - yes  
Elmer - yes  
Jesus - yes  
Leslie – (logged off)  
Lin Min - yes  
Ma'ayan - yes  
Moises - yes  
Patricia - yes  
Rae – yes  
Yolanda - yes  
Motion APPROVED

### **Item 8 – Future Agenda Items – Richard France**

EA Richard reported that it was covered at the other meeting and he let everyone know that the agenda for the last two meetings on January 26<sup>th</sup> and February 16<sup>th</sup> was already full, but if anyone had anything to add to let them know.

Suggestions, comments, questions and answers were provided.

- Member Asiyahola stated that as the group moves into developing the final recommendations and maybe something the Research Team could do some lead thinking on and report back at the next meeting, he suggested to come up with a handful of criteria that the group could use to evaluate the recommendations that the group is coming up with and narrow them down to a manageable number and that it could be a generic criteria like feasibility, impact, fit for LADOT, alignment with social

movement goals or demands. And if folks think it is a good idea that it could be added to the agenda for the next Research Sub-committee meeting.

- EA Richard stated that it made a lot of sense and asked for any reactions from the members.
- President Chauncee agreed with Member Asiyahola's idea.
- PM Pamela talked about extending the duration of future meetings discussed with EA Richard as the work is ramping up.
- EA Richard shared the scheduling plan that meetings will start earlier at 4:30pm – 6:30pm, 2 hours instead of 90 minutes based on suggestions from the task force members, and asked if there were any objections to the scheduling.
- President Chauncee stated that it works for him.
- Member Patricia stated that it works for her also.
- Member Elmer stated that 4:30pm works for him also.
- Member Lin Min asked Commander Lurie if he could include the training data for LAPD when he made his presentation on February 2<sup>nd</sup>.
- Commander Lurie asked to clarify which training data Member Lin Min was referring to.
- Member Lin Min stated that specifically on racial bias and any unconscious bias would be great specifically on traffic stops, how do officers approach when they have a moving and non-moving violation.
- For clarification, Commander Lurie asked if February 2<sup>nd</sup> is still at 5:00pm.
- PM Pamela confirmed that the February 2<sup>nd</sup> is still at 5:00pm for a full hour.
- For the interviews that are moving forward, Member Lin Min asked to clarify that the group is asking to give feedback on proposed recommendations and asked to share what proposed recommendations they are being interviewed on.
- EA Richard discussed their plan to have working sessions with task force members in early February to start coming up with those recommendations and shared the legal team's idea as those develop. Added that they do not have anything specific to share with interviewees at the current time.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

Member Asiyahola moved, seconded by Member Yolanda to adjourn the meeting.

CEA Jasmin took roll call votes by name.

Asiyahola – yes

Benjamin - yes

Candyce - yes

Chauncee - yes

Elmer - yes

Jesus - yes

Leslie – (logged off)

Lin Min - yes

Ma'ayan - yes

Moises - yes

Patricia - yes

Rae – (logged off)

Yolanda - yes

Motion APPROVED.

APPROVED: 01/26/2023

Traffic Enforcement Alternatives Advisory  
Task Force



Commission Executive Assistant

Meeting adjourned at 6:41 PM.